

**REGULAR MEETING
OF THE SAN MARINO PLANNING COMMISSION
JUNE 22, 2016 - 7:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Lundgren called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL **PRESENT:** Chairman Ben Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos,
Howard Brody, Se-Yao Hsu, Alternate Susan Jakubowski

ABSENT: Raymond Cheng

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Cordelia Donnelly, 2725 Monterey Road, spoke about the required legal findings for Planning Commission projects.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**1. DESIGN REVIEW NOS. DRC15-99 AND DRC16-23
1470 VIRGINIA ROAD, (CHAN/TYLER)**

Assistant Planner Choi presented the staff report for this item and answered questions. She stated staff was in support of the project subject to the condition found in the staff report.

Rob Tyler, architect, and Robert Martin, landscape architect, presented the project and answered questions.

The following people spoke about the project:

Dennis Kneier, 1425 Hampton Road, in support
Laurie Barlow, 2434 Sherwood Road, in opposition
Fran Benuska, 2410 Coniston Place, in opposition
Shirley Jagels, 1404 Wilson Avenue, in opposition

It was the consensus of the Planning Commission that they agreed with the historic resources report, which concluded the house is not a significant historic resource. The Planning Commission also felt the proposed house and front yard walls met all of the required Design Review findings.

Chairman Velayos moved to approve the project subject to the following conditions:

1. The front yard wall shall be no more than eighteen inches (18") in height. At certain limited locations, the wall may be up to two feet (2') in height subject to staff approval.
2. The existing condition of 1470 Virginia Road will be documented by a qualified preservation professional in accordance with Historic American

Building Survey (HABS) short format guidelines and standards. Documentation shall include a historic narrative, existing drawings and plans (if available), and large-format photographs of the property. Copies of the documentation will be submitted to the City of San Marino Planning Department and the Theodore Pletsch archives at the Pasadena Museum of History.

Seconded by Commissioner Brody. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: None.

**2. MODIFICATION TO DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE NO. DRC14-99 AND MODIFICATION TO CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. CUP15-15
1617 OLD MILL ROAD, (KAUFELDT-BOARDMAN)**

Chairman Lundgren recused himself from this item due to a potential conflict of interest.

Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski recused herself from this item due to living within 500' of the subject property.

Associate Planner Merlo presented the staff report and stated that staff was in support of the project subject to the conditions found in the report.

Deborah Kaufeldt-Boardman, owner, presented the project and answered questions.

The following person spoke about the project:

Nancy Hoffman, 1234 Roanoke Road, in opposition

It was the consensus of the Planning Commission that the project met all of the required findings for the modification to the house and for the circular driveway could be met as the project was compatible with the neighborhood and existing house.

Commissioner Brody moved to approve the project subject to the following conditions:

1. The quartzite cladding on the north bathroom area shall be eliminated.
2. If the proposed quartzite color is not available, the driveway shall be brushed finish concrete. All other proposed quartzite finishes shall be per the previously-approved plans.

Second by Commissioner Hsu. AYES: Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu. NOES: None.

**3. VARIANCE V16-02 AND DESIGN REVIEW DRC16-02
2364 CUMBERLAND ROAD, (SITU)**

Assistant Planner Choi presented the project and stated that staff recommended denial of the project. She also stated that a neighbor, Mr. Loftus, expressed his support for the project via a phone call with staff.

Mr. Situ, owner, presented the project.

The following people spoke about the project:

Fran Benuska, 2410 Coniston Place, in support
David Morris, 2352 Cumberland Road, in support

It was the consensus of the Planning Commission that the wall appeared massive and all of the required variance findings could not be met. They were also concerned with the lack of an arborist report for the tree located near the proposed wall.

Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski moved to deny the project. Seconded by Commissioner Brody. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: None.

**4. APPEAL OF DESIGN REVIEW NO. DRC15-107
2630 LORAIN ROAD, (TANG)**

Associate Planner Merlo presented the report and explained the history of the lot. She stated staff recommended a continuance of the project to address design issues.

Vice-Chairman Velayos asked about the certificate of compliance that will remove the existing lot tie and create two lots. He was concerned about the proposed condition of approval that required the approval and construction of two houses. Staff indicated they will consult with the City Attorney.

The following appellants spoke in opposition to the project:

Dale Pederson
Laurie Barlow, 2434 Sherwood Road
John Ryan, 1385 Bellwood Road
Shirley Jagels, 1404 Wilson Avenue
Maryadele Clougherty, 2794 Gainsborough Drive

Jimmy Gutierrez, applicant's attorney, stated he challenged the validity of the appeal and questioned the letters that were submitted after the appeal deadline. He also discussed the design and compatibility of the proposal.

Vice-Chairman Velayos stated he would like clarification from the City Attorney regarding the appeal process. He read the appeal code section for the record.

The following people spoke about the project:

Nancy Hoffman, 1234 Roanoke Road, in opposition
Rich Haserot, 2365 Sherwood Road, in opposition
Kevin Lai, 2625 Lorain Road, in support
Allen Tsai, 1335 Bedford Road, in support
Mr. Jin, 1475 Bellwood Road, in support

Francis Teng, owner, answered questions for the Commission.

Vice-Chairman Velayos stated he needed further information on whether the lot tie issue is relevant to the Planning Commission's review, the standard of review for appeals, and the square footage information for the neighborhood.

Commissioner Brody stated the project is not a Cape Code design and that he was concerned that the DRC and staff were in support of the project. He was in favor of granting the appeal.

Commissioner Hsu agreed with Vice-Chairman Velayos that more information was needed.

Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski stated she also would like more information on the procedural issues. She stated the owner should consider a one-story house as the proposal was too massive. She was in support of the appeal.

Chairman Lundgren agreed further information was needed before he could approved or deny the project.

Commissioner Brody stated the City Attorney can respond to the procedural questions separate from the appeal. He moved to approve the appeal and deny the project.

Vice-Chairman Velayos stated he would abstain from the vote due to a lack of information.

Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski seconded the motion. AYES: Commissioner Brody, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: Chairman Lundgren, Commissioner Hsu. ABSTAIN: Vice-Chairman Velayos.

The motion failed.

Commissioner Hsu moved to continue the project to the meeting of July 27, 2016. Second by Vice-Chairman Velayos. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman

Velayos, Commissioner Hsu. NOES: Commissioner Brody. ABSTAIN: Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski.

OTHER MATTERS

**5. PROJECT STATUS REPORT
1001 ROSALIND ROAD, (ZHONG)**

City Staff presented the first status report to the Planning Commission. After discussing the status of the construction and the schedule, the item was continued for 30-days in order to confirm the compliance with the landscaping on the property, to verify the insurance policy and to review the protocol for notifying the owner of any violation.

**6. RESOLUTION OF FINDINGS FOR MODIFICATION TO CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT CUP13-32, MODIFICATION TO DESIGN REVIEW DRC13-83, MODIFICATION TO VARIANCE V13-09, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT CUP16-06, AND VARIANCE V16-03
1155 OAK GROVE AVENUE, (THORNTON)**

Commissioner Brody moved to approve the resolution. Second by Commissioner Hsu. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: None.

**7. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF THE APPROVAL OF CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT CUP15-09
2660 OAK KNOLL AVENUE, (MCNULTY)**

Commissioner Brody moved to approve the extension for one year. Second by Commissioner Hsu. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: None.

8. MAY 25, 2016 MEETING MINUTES

Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski moved to approve the minutes. Second by Commissioner Brody. AYES: Chairman Lundgren, Vice-Chairman Velayos, Commissioner Brody, Commissioner Hsu, Alternate Commissioner Jakubowski. NOES: None.

PUBLIC COMMENT

ADJOURNMENT

With no further items to consider, the Planning Commission adjourned to the next regular meeting on Wednesday, July 27, 2016 in the City Hall Council Chambers, 2200 Huntington Drive, San Marino, CA 91108.



ALDO CERVANTES,
SECRETARY